THE FLOWER MOUNTAIN MURDERS.

PART SEVEN: OFFICIAL REPORTS FROM THE HUASHAN COMMISSION OF ENQUIRY:

7.1. RICHARD W. MANSFIELD, BRITISH CONSUL, FOOCHOW.

7.2. COMMANDER J. S. NEWELL, USN. MEMBER OF COMMISSION OF ENQUIRY.

TIMELINE: 23 OCTOBER 1895-10 FEBRUARY 1896.

1895, October 23.

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, October 23, 1895, No 2405, Denby to Olney.

Sir:—I have the honor to enclose as matter of information a copy of a report made by R. W. Mansfield, H.B.M's Consul at Foochow, "on the conduct of the Chinese authorities of Fukien in connection with the massacre at Huashan in the Kutien District on August 1st, 1895 by which 11 British subjects lost their lives and others were wounded."

This copy was kindly furnished me by H.B.M's Minister.

I deem it best to await a report from Mr. Hixson before making any remarks on the subject matter thereof. I have, etc. Charles Denby..

Part 7.1 Richard W. Mansfield, British Consul, Foochow, from Kut'ien, 8 September 1895.

Report on the conduct of the Chinese Authorities of Fuhkien in connection with the massacre of Huashan on Aug. 1, 1895, by which 11 British subjects lost their lives and others were wounded.

A careful investigation shows that the massacre was deliberately planned a few days beforehand by 6 of the more influential members of a sect known as the "Vegetarians" (Ts'ai Hui) at a mountain fastness called K'unshanchi, some 15 or 20 miles from Huashan. As a detailed report of the facts relating to this sect is being prepared, it will suffice here to touch lightly only on the antecedents is so far as they throw into relief the deplorable weakness and duplicity of the local authorities which were the indirect cause of the massacre. It appears that this sect, though it has long existed in Kiangsi, and elsewhere, only obtained a footing in this district of Kutien some 5 or 6 years ago. Up to last year, 1894, it did not apparently make itself conspicuous in any way, but then began an action propaganda, and its numbers swelled to several thousand members. It was in that year, during the governance of the District Magistrate, Wang Y-yang, that the power of the sect began to make itself felt by a number of lawless acts, such as ravaging crops, robbing houses, etc., etc.

Over 100 cases of the kind were reported to the Magistrate, but this official instead of dealing energetically with them, not only allowed matters to take their course, but concealed from the higher authorities that his power was gone, dreading no doubt that blame would attach to himself if the high authorities became aware of the facts. In some of the cases converts had suffered, and orders, at my instance, were repeatedly sent to the Magistrate, from Foochow, to enquire into them. Nothing, however, was done, and finding that the case was not one of religious prosecution, I did not press it further.

In December last the Magistrate had been induced by his confidential clerk Chiang to arrest and convey to his Yamen 4 of the Vegetarians who had been using seditious language. He administered 400 blows to each of these men and put them in prison. 5 days later over 100 members of the sect arrived and demanded the release of the prisoners. The Magistrate, afraid to resist, entered into negotiations, in which the District Police Master, Li Ch'I Ts'eng, and a graduate named Lan, the legal adviser of the Vegetarians, acted as middlemen. The result was that the confidential clerk or head runner, Chiang, above mentioned, was punished for his activity with 400 blows administered in public and was dismissed, and the 4 prisoners wee sent back to their homes in chairs with colored hangings.

After this act of signal weakness, all respect for the Magistrate of course disappeared, and the Vegetarians had everything practically their own way. The Foochow authorities wee informed by me of what had occurred, and I believe, called for a report; but the Magistrate undoubtedly concealed the humiliation to which he had been subjected and the growing power of the sect.

In March last it was reported in the city of Ku'tien that a large force of Vegetarians were going to attack it, and the officials and gentry had the gates walled up. This state of siege lasted 4 days, and, I have reason to believe, only terminated by further concessions on the part of the Magistrate, to the demands of the Vegetarians. On the report of the Rev. R. Stewart, I brought the matter to the notice of the Chinese authorities, and on the 1st April last wrote strongly urging the Viceroy to send troops, as the Vegetarians were a standing menace, not so much to the missionaries as to the Chinese Government. The Viceroy T'an Chunglin replied a fortnight later that he had sent a Wei Yuan to enquire into the truth of the matter and the Wei Yuan had returned and reported that all was quiet.

I have since ascertained that this Wei Yuan was one Li (given name unknown) a man who had been Magistrate of the Kienyang District, and who had behaved extremely badly in a recent case at his district city, when a house was burnt and filth thrown over a British missionary. He only stayed one day at Kut'ien. The Viceroy seems, however, to have been aware of the weakness and inefficiency of the Kut'ien Magistrate, Wang Yin-yang, for he was removed from his post, and another man, Wang Julin, appointed instead, about the 2d of May last. No soldiers were, however, sent and the new Magistrate appears to have continued the weak and vacillating policy of his predecessor.

In July, a murder was committed by Vegetarians at a village called Choyang, some 26 miles fro Kut'ien City, and when the runners arrived to make arrests they were prevented from doing so by the other members of the sect. This was, it appears, reported to the new Viceroy, Pien Pao-chuan, who only arrived at Foochow

in May last. He sent up a wei-yuan, Ho Ting, with 200 soldiers under the command of Colonel T'ang, to the assistance of the Magistrate, but these officials were afraid to attempt the arrest of the murderers with what they considered an inadequate force. Two days before the massacre, it was reported to the Magistrate that the Vegetarians contemplated an attack on the chapel at Anchang village, and he was vainly begged to send soldiers. Had he done so, the massacre might probably have been averted, for Anchang lies directly on the road between the mountain fastness K'unshanch'I and Huashan, and in the line of march of the assassins, and close to the former place. As a consequence of the above mentioned Chinese murder case, the Magistrate, Wang Julin, was superseded, but his successor, the present Magistrate, I Chien, did not arrive here until 4 days after the massacre. I may add that when the Magistrate Wang was asked by Dr. Gregory of an escort to take him to the relief of the wounded, he made considerable difficulty about giving it, and it was only under pressure from the Deputy Ho that he granted it. His own conduct at Huashan on the evening after the massacre was that of a man had had completely lost his head. He said to Dr. Gregory, "This is all the fault of the Foochow authorities. I never asked for soldiers, and what was the good of sending me 200 when the Vegetarians are in thousands!"

From the above brief account the following facts are apparent;-

That the Viceroy T'an Chunglin, now at Canton, was much to blame in not taking proper measures to ascertain the truth as to what was going on in the Kut'ien District under his jurisdiction, and in refusing to send troops to Kut'ien when such action would have easily checked the power of the Vegetarians. He was informed by me of the actual state of things, and contented himself with sending an incompetent and notoriously anti-foreign deputy who only remained one night on the spot.

That the newly arrived Viceroy Pien Pao-chuan failed to appreciate the gravity of the case, and sent an insufficient force to the aid of the Magistrate. He had however, been in ill-health since his arrival, and had probably been kept in the dark by his subordinates. His action in sending 200 soldiers, though it appears to have been the exciting cause of the planning of the massacre, was probably well meant, and had the soldiers been boldly used they might probably have been able to do much pending the arrival of reinforcements. Such use was not made of them, owing to the cowardice of the Magistrate. This Viceroy's action since the massacre has been vigorous and effective, though exception might be taken to the tone of his replies to some of the Consul's despatches.

That the District Magistrate Wang Yuyang displayed a weakness and incompetency which proved him absolutely unfitted for any official position, and his duplicity in concealing as far as possible, from his superiors what was taking place in his District, cannot be too strongly blamed.

That the District Magistrate Wang Julin, who succeeded the above officer, continued the feeble and cowardly policy of his predecessor. He found the District, on his arrival, in a most critical state, and he had every opportunity to report it, as the blame rested with his predecessor. Even with the force of 200 soldiers sent him by the Viceroy he could with a little courage and determination, have done much. I my opinion he too is unfit for the public service.

That the Viceroy's deputy, Ho ting, was not a strong enough man for the task entrusted to him. His conduct has, however, its redeeming points, and it is believed that he did his best to obtain at Foochow a stronger force.

That the District Police Master, Li Ch'i-ts'eng, is highly to blame, and deserving of severe punishment. Though not a Vegetarian himself, he is openly declared to have favored them, and was intimately acquainted with Liu Yin Chin, one of the worst of the Huashan murderers. He took a prominent part in the disgraceful capitulation of the Magistrate in the matter of the arrests above recorded. He has been many years in Kut'ien and had full cognizance of all that happened.

As regards the conduct of the officials here since the massacres, I will add a few remarks.

The Prefect, Ch'in Pingchih arrived here 5 days after the massacre. He appears to have acted promptly, and by the time I arrived on the scene, on the 16th August, had already effected a number of arrests, including the most important criminal. He refused to allow the Consuls to attend the preliminary examinations was not an absolute one, but merely a statement that he must telegraph to the Viceroy for instructions before

permitting it. To do him justice, he has since met all our demands with courtesy and attention, and I have no reason to complain of him, except in that I have observed a tendency on his part to make out that the Huashan massacre was the outcome of a feud between the Vegetarians on the one part and the missionaries and convert on the other. This is not borne out by the evidence. There can be no doubt that the movement was purely political though doubtless the extirpation of foreigners formed a part of the eventual programme.

The Magistrate I Chien, who arrived on the 5th August, the same day as the Prefect, has shown himself an able and energetic official. In his capacity as presiding magistrate, he has fulfilled his duties admirably, without undue severity, and with shrewdness and discrimination. I have, however, to complain of an animus on his part towards the native Christians, whom he mentioned in a proclamation to the Lien Chia, or home-guards, along with the Vegetarians as persons who were to be admitted into the guard, but of whom a list was to be kept and furnished to the Magistrates.

This proclamation has been withdrawn and another substituted omitting mention of the Christians altogether, but the incident shows that without severe warning he is not to be trusted to deal impartially with cases where converts are concerned.

I have now, I think, reported on the conduct of all the officials who are in any way connected with the circumstances which led to the Huashan massacre, and with later proceedings. It is probably unnecessary to add that of any complicity with the murderers I hold them entirely innocent.

There is one remark I should like to make, and that is that the general system which removes or degrades a Magistrate for any outbreak or cause which may occur in his district, without taking into consideration the circumstances of the individual case, which may have been beyond his control, is answerable for the manner in which Magistrates endeavor to conceal and hush up such outbreaks and crimes, when free speaking would easily avert future danger. (Sgd), R. W. Mansfield, H.B.M. Consul.

1895, October 15.

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, October 15, 1895, No 2399, Denby to Olney.

Sir:—I have the honor to forward to you an abstract of a report bearing date September 13th made by H.B.M's Consul to H.B.M's Minister from Kucheng, which has been kindly furnished me by Sir Nicholas O'Conor.

The Consul states that:

A band of over two hundred men armed with spears, tridents, swords, knives, etc., started from Kun Shan Chi, a mountain fastness, in the evening of the 31st July, their avowed object being a raid on the foreigners at Huashan. The leaders and planners of the expedition, six in number, had debated for nearly a week beforehand the question as to whether they should attack a missionary establishment at Yanchu village, the city of Kutien or the summer resort of the missionaries at Huashan.

The plan of attack on the city was to assemble secretly, set fire in three places and in the tumult created to kill the Magistrate and loot his Yamen and the houses of the wealthy residents. Eventually they cast lots and Huashan was decided on as the aim of the expedition. After the start it appears that a good many whose hearts failed them when they knew that murder was contemplated, or had been coerced into going, dropped out on various pretexts and did not reach Huashan. It is proved, however, by overwhelming evidence that over a hundred of the more determined did actually arrive at Huashan and took a more or less active part in the proceedings there. Those who actually killed and wounded were many more than the Consul first supposed.

For instance, three men at least (all in custody) are proved to have shared in Mr. Stewart's murder; two joined in killing Mrs. Stewart, and there was much indiscriminate cutting and slashing at five of the ladies who were all together. Only two ladies seemingly met their death at the hand of a single assailant, and most of the survivors were covered with blows, and wounds. There is evidence to show that kerosene was brought in bamboo tubes for the purpose of burning the houses. When it is considered that all these ruffians were armed, knew beforehand that murder was intended, and while some of their number were engaged in that crime, others hastened to secure all available loot, it appears impossible to regard any one of those present as a minor criminal. Those who made themselves most prominent are, with the exception of ten, now in custody, but there are many still at large who have plunder in their possession, and who for days after the massacre, made no secret of the fact that they joined in the crime. From the information obtained from the numerous Christians in this district, there is little doubt but that if the authorities are kept up to the mark all these malefactors can be arrested, but their boldness makes it evident that a terrible example is necessary if such things are to be avoided in the future and safety secured for the foreigners in the district.

The Consul proceeds to argue that the letter of the law should be insisted on with regard to a majority of the cases, reserving the right to interpose for a mitigation of sentence when the atonement appears sufficient. He asks that he be permitted to decide on the merits of each case investigated, and states that he would admit extenuating circumstances as justifying a mitigation of the death penalty.

He states further that some of the prisoners seem to glory in their deeds. He continues:

I will now pass on the cases we have gone into. Of the thirty five above mentioned thirteen have been already reported to the Viceroy for execution and thirteen more are convicted as taking a more or less active part in the murder, or are instigators or leaders. The others with the exception of the doubtful cases were present at the massacre and some had loot in their possession. There are a good many other cases yet untried, and arrests are still being made thought not as rapidly as at first.

He reports the work done as satisfactory but he says he has had reason to complain of duplicity on the part of the Chinese authorities.

He proceeds to state that the Christians numbering over two thousand in the Kutien district have been of

great use to the Commission in finding out the names of those concerned in the massacre.¹ This conduct has created soreness in the minds of the Chinese authorities, who have endeavoured to show that the massacre was the result of a feud between the Christians and the Vegetarians. These latter are a political society which is plotting the overthrow of the Government. Unless this society is suppressed attempts at reprisals against the Christians are to be apprehended.

He states at the close that Tu Chu-yi, one of the two notorious criminals, has been arrested. I have etc. Charles Denby

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, December 18, 1895. No. 2451, Denby to Olney

To the Honorable Richard Olney, Secretary of State, Washington, D.C.

Sir: I have the honor to enclose the original of the report of Commander J. S. Newell, Member of the Committee of Investigation on the part of the United States to enquire into the massacre which occurred near the village of Hua-shan, China, August 1895. This report is full and exhaustive, and is greatly creditable to Commander Newell. I instructed the Commission that there should be a joint report, and I presume that there will be one, but it has not yet reached this Legation. Until such a report is received I do not deem it necessary to make any extended observations on the matter involved.

The report gives a complete history of the origin of the massacre, of its perpetration, of the proceedings held before the Committee and of the conduct of the officials relating thereto.

As a result of the investigation twenty-six criminals have been beheaded.

Commander Newell states that the Commission:

persistently demanded that the participants in the massacre should be tried, convicted and sentenced in accordance with the criminal code of China.

He states further that the Commission regarded its duty to be solely that of investigation' and that it did not assume judicial or other functions, but recognized that the ultimate settlement belonged to the United States Government.

This line of conduct, accords, I believe, strictly with your instructions, which were communicated to the Commission by me.

I have, etc., Charles Denby

Inclosure in No 2451 Report of Commander Newell. (Next page)

1

The Chinese official view was that the Christians were taking the opportunity to settle old scores by informing on people, irrespective of their involvement in the Huashan Massacre. See Part Six: Aftermath: FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, October 9, 1895, No 2393, Denby to Olney. Enclosure 1 in No 2393.

Part 7.2 Report: Commander J. S. Newell, U.S.N. Foochow, China, November –, 1895.

Sir,—I have the honor to submit the following report regarding the attack made upon missionaries residing near the village of Huashan, China, August 1, 1895.

- 1. Missionaries residing and working in the district of Kutien belong to the Anglican Church Missionary Society and the Methodist Episcopal Church of the United States. In was the custom of the Anglican Church Missionary Society missionaries to pass the months of July and August near Huashan, where the society had erected two foreign cottages (called chapels by the Chinese) for their use.²
- 2. Huashan village, at an elevation of more than 2,000 feet above the sea level, lies some 10 miles in a southwesterly direction from Kutien, a district city of the province of Fukien, the provincial city being Foochow, on the Min River, 30 miles from the sea, the residence of the prefect of this prefecture, as well as that of the Viceroy of the province.
- 3. Kutien city is situated 100 miles to the north and west of Foochow, the route usually followed between the two places being by the River Min for 73 miles to the village of Sui-kow, and thence overland for 33 miles, following for the greater portion of the distance the Kutien Creek, a branch of the River Min, which, owing to the many rapids, is not navigable. Kutien City has an elevation of 1,000 feet above the level of the sea. Sui-kow is connected by telegraph with Foochow and Peking.
- 4. The colony of missionaries at Huashan on the day of the massacres included Rev. Robert Warren Stewart, C.M.S., his wife, Louisa K. Stewart, C.M.S., and their children, Mildred, aged 12 years, Kathleen, aged 11 years, Herbert, aged 6 years, Evan, aged 3 years, Hilda Sylvia, aged 13 months, with the nurse, Helena Yellop; Miss Hessie Newcombe, C.E.Z.M.S., Miss Elsie Marshall, C.E.Z.M.S., Miss Flora Lucy Stewart, C.E.Z.M.S., Miss Flora Codrington, C.E.Z.M.S., natives of Great Britain; Miss Mary Ann Christina Gordon, C.E.Z.M.S., Miss Harriette Elinor (Nellie) Saunders, C.M.S., Miss Elizabeth Maud (Topsy) Saunders, C.M.S., natives of Australia; Rev. H. S. Phillips, C.M.S., of England, and Miss Mabel C. Hartford, of Dover, N.H., a member of the American Methodist Episcopal Church.
- 5. The members of this colony, with the exception of Miss Hartford and Mr. Phillips occupied the two foreign houses. Miss Hartford lived in a native house, leased for a number of years, situated about 150 yards to the north and west, being to the rear and considerably below the level of the foreign houses; whereas Mr. Phillips, having arrived a few days before, was domiciled in a native house still further removed, but in the same general direction as the one occupied by Miss Hartford from the houses erected by the C.M.S.³
- 6. The two foreign houses, built with mud walls and tiled roofs, were one-storey buildings, facing the south, with outhouses for the Chinese teachers and servants at the rear, but connected. These houses were on different levels, and the front of the lower house was 15 feet to the rear of the front of the upper one, the side walls being about 8 feet apart and the difference of level of the two houses about the same. Mr. Stewart and family, with the Misses Saunders, occupied the upper house, while the ladies of the C.E.Z.M.S. lived in the lower one.
- 7. The usual highway⁴ to the village of Huashan passes 200 to 300 yards to the eastward of the houses and at a much higher level. Between this highway and the houses, as well as around them, except in the

² This observation is relevant to the references in the collection to the destruction of "chapels" in anti-missionary riots.

³ See map in Introduction: p. 3. See photographs at Part Six: Letters and Reports of the Rev. William Banister.

⁴ The word "Highway" may be misleading. It was a well-worn footpath, not much more than four feet wide and impassable to vehicles of any kind, as was the case with all the paths in Gutian District, The only form of conveyance was a sedan chair, used by wealthy Chinese and foreigners.

small ravine separating them from Miss Hartford's house, are groves of young bamboo trees interspersed with pine and other trees of a larger growth.

- 8. Between 6 and 7 in the morning of Thursday, August 1, 1895, before many of adult members of this small colony had risen for the day, a party of Chinese members of a sect or secret society known as "Vegetarians, armed with guns, spears, swords, tridents, knives, or heavy, sharp-pointed bamboo sticks, descended upon the two houses and attacked the occupants, stabbing, cutting, and beating the latter.
- 9. The attack ended by the looting and burning of both houses, also in the robbery of the dead and living. During the melee at least one member of the attacking party rushed to the house where Miss Hartford was living and made a most determined attack with murderous intent upon this lady, and to the prompt intervention of the wife of her native teacher, and also of her native servant, Miss Hartford undoubtedly owes her escape from death.⁵
- 10. This fiendish attack resulted in the killing of Mr. Stewart, Mrs. Stewart, the nurse Lena, the Misses Newcombe, Marshall, Stewart, Gordon, and the Misses Nellie and Topsy Saunders, nine adults; and the wounding of the Misses Codrington and Hartford and all the Stewart children, two adults and five children. Herbert Stewart died the second day after the attack and the baby one week after reaching Foochow, swelling the number of deaths to eleven. Mildred Stewart will be lame and probably disfigured for life. The bodies of Mr. and Mrs. Stewart and those of Miss Nellie Saunders and the nurse, Lena were consumed in the burning house. Miss Newcombe's body was found down an embankment to the south and east of the lower house; the remaining bodies were grouped in the rear of the upper house.
- 11. Mr. Phillips, whose escape from attack can only be attributed to his late arrival and the ignorance of the Vegetarians to his presence, attracted by the noise and uproar ran toward the scene from the native house in which he was dwelling, meeting the native servants of Mr. Stewart, who advised and tried to prevent his going, saying that the Vegetarians had come. He pushed on until within sight of the houses, when, seeing a great number of natives surrounding the houses carrying bundles, but no foreigners, he concluded that the inmates had made their escape. Mr. Phillips then continued on, passing around the hill at a much lower level than the houses, and reaching the side opposite that of his approach he took refuge in the bamboo grove behind two trees, where he was an eye witness of the conflagration. Soon after this a horn was sounded and the Vegetarians took their departure. Shortly afterwards, seeing no one about, Mr. Phillips left his hiding place and approached the houses. Meeting a servant, who informed him that the survivors had taken shelter in Miss Hartford's house, he at once went there and rendered such service as he could to the sufferers, and to his presence and efforts Miss Codrington unquestionably owes her life. Mr. Phillips as soon as possible sent messengers to Dr. Gregory, the only foreigner nearer than Foochow, and to Foochow with the news of the massacre.
- 12. Dr. J. J. Gregory, M.D., in charge of the hospital at Kutien, built and controlled by the American Methodist Episcopal Church, was first informed of the outrage shortly after noon by a native, followed a few minutes later by the messenger from Mr. Phillips, who brought a hastily written and brief note confirming the sad news. Dr. Gregory immediately went to the yamen of the district magistrate, and by his persistent and urgent demands succeeded in having an official (the magistrate), with a guard of soldiers, sent to the scene; and reached the wounded at 8 that evening. Fist giving the sufferers the attention needed, he then with great difficulty obtained the necessary manual assistance from the villagers and soldiers to prepare the remains for transportation, placing the bodies in coffins and the incinerated remains in boxes, and to carry the same to Sui-kow,
- 13. At 3 p.m. on the 2d of August the remains were sent to Sui-kow, followed soon after by the wounded, attended by Dr. Gregory and Mr. Phillips. Herbert Stewart died from his injuries soon after the journey

⁵ This paragraph was very carefully drafted to include a direct use of "murderous intent" which provided the legal basis for the strong American intervention in the Commission of Inquiry. The Chinese Government thought the American response excessive given that Miss Hartford was not seriously injured.

began. Arriving at Sui-kow at 3.30 a.m. in the following morning, the wounded were placed in boats that had been pressed into service by order of the magistrate, and not waiting for the bodies, the wounded left Sui-kow that afternoon on their trip down the River Min. On the next morning, a steam launch towing a house boat taking the prefect, Ch'in Ping-chi, to Sui-kow, was met. Dr. Gregory requested that the launch be detailed to tow the boats with the wounded on board, in order to hasten the arrival at Foochow, the heat being intense and the wounded in need of immediate relief. The prefect replied that he would, upon his arrival at Sui-kow, immediate send the launch back. As this meant a prolonged trip, and the boats could easily float down the stream to their destination in less time than it would take the launch to go to Sui-kow and return, Dr. Gregory peremptorily demanded the use of the launch at once (before this, at the invitation of the doctor, the prefer had taken a look at the wounded, and should have recognized the gravity of the case). The prefect reluctantly yielded. By the aid of the launch Foochow was reached at 1.30 p.m. the 4th of August. Before reaching a steam launch sent by United States Consul Hixson, having on board United States Marshall Hixson,⁶ Archdeacon Wolfe, Church Missionary Society, and Rev. W. Banister, Church Missionary Society, was met bringing supplies and assistance to the party; shortly afterwards the house boat of Mr. A. W. V. Gibb, in which this gentleman had promptly come to meet the party with more supplies, was met. At Foochow the party was met by the United States and British consuls, and a large party of sympathetic friends, the wounded being immediately transferred to the hospitals. The baby died within a week. The eleven graves in the quiet burying ground at Foochow will tell for years to come their mute story of the terrible tragedy.⁷

- 14. The statements of the survivors, Misses Hartford and Codrington, Kathleen Stewart, and Rev. Mr. Phillips, as well as that of Dr. J. J. Gregory, are appended to this report and marked A,B,C,D, and E.⁸
- 15. The village of Huashan is small—300 inhabitants— and lies on the opposite side of a deep ravine from the foreign houses, the communication between the two being by the main highway that winds around the sides of the ravine. A few straggling houses on the same side of the ravine as the foreign ones stretch along the highway. This village has never been a fruitful field for mission work; a Catechist was sustained there for several years by the Church Missionary Society, but two natives were baptized, these having renounced the Christian religion. The Catechist was sent elsewhere and the field abandoned. This location of the foreign houses as a sanitarium can hardly be said to have been among friends or sympathizers.
- 16. Having been notified on the 12th of August, the day the *Detroit* arrived at Pagoda Anchorage, Min River, by the United States Consul J. Courtney Hixson of his intention, under the orders of the United States Minister, to proceed the next day to Kutien to begin an investigation into the massacre, I offered, if there was no objection, to send an officer to accompany him; as there was none, but on the contrary being assured that such action would be most agreeable, I directed Ensign Waldo Evans, United States Navy, to accompany the consul unofficially, in order that I might be informed of the condition and progress of affairs. The United States and British consuls left Foochow on the afternoon of the 13th August, and reached Kutien the evening of the 16th, having been met some distance outside of the city

⁶ Marshall William Hixson was apparently Col. Hixson's nephew.

Hixson, William Carter, A. B., A. M., '92, teacher, Waco, Tex.

University of Alabama 1887, Union Springs; s. Rev. J. O. Hixson and Mattie Thurman Brown;

^{b. March 14, 1869; Prof., Claiborne Col., Homer, La., 1890-92, Prin., Longview, Tex.,} High School, 1892-94; U. S. Marshal, Foochow, China, 1894-96; Acting Consul at Foochow, 1896; V. Consul at Foochow, China, 1897; Instructor, Waco, Tex., High School, 1897-99; Prin., 1st Dist. High School, Waco, 1899 — ; m. Pearl Rivers Howard, Longview, Tex., June 3, 1894. Source: University of Alabama. A register of the officers and students of the University of Alabama, 1831-1901.Online 1 July 2010: www.ebooksread.com/.../page-33-a-register-of-theofficers-and-students-of-the-university-of-alabama-1831-1901-hci.shtml.

⁷ See Part Six: The Aftermath: The British (or International) Cemetery at Foochow survived until c1966 when it, along with many other foreign cemeteries in China, was destroyed as part of the Cultural Revolution in China. The site was subsequently used for industrial purposes. One gate post survives in a wall surrounding the site.

⁸ These statement are reproduced elsewhere in the collection and have been omitted.

by a party of native Christians who came to welcome them. Having received after the departure of the consuls telegraphic instructions notifying me of my appointment as a member of the American committee, I was able to join (the viceroy delaying me by his objections) the United States consul at Kutien in the evening of the 27th. The consuls had been instructed to cooperate in the investigation.

- 17. I found both consular parties domiciled in the houses of the American Methodist Episcopal mission, the only foreign houses within the city walls, those of the C. M.S. bring without the city wall and on the opposite side Kutien Creek. The parties were composed as follows: American, Consul J. C. Hixson, Commanded J. s. Newell, Dr. J. J. Gregory, M.D., Ensign Waldo Evans, Dr. E. G. Hart, M.D.; British, Consul R. W. Mansfield, Vice-Consul E. L. B. Allen, Rev. W. Banister, C.M.S. and Rev. L. H. Star, C. M. S.
- 18. Dr. Hart, of the Methodist Episcopal Mission, the intended relief of Dr. Gregory, at my request accompanied me from Foochow. Dr. Hart and Mr. Star returned to Foochow September 11, the former returning to Kutien September 27 and again leaving October 5. Vice-Consul Allen returned to Foochow October 5, his place being taken by Mr. G. D. Pitzipios, an assistant in the British consular service at Foochow, who arrived the next day. Ensign Evans resumed his duties on the *Detroit* October 6. Consul Mansfield and Mr. Banister went to Foochow on October 11, returning the 18th. While there the consul had an interview with the viceroy, when the final punishments of the participants in the Huashan affair were agreed upon, the United States committee being no party to the agreement.
- 19. On October 20 both parties withdrew from Kutien, reaching Foochow the next day; having passed sixtyone days in Kutien, twenty-eight of which were spent in the trial of prisoners.⁹
- 20. The day after the arrival of the consuls the prefect, Ch'in Ping-chi, called, followed the next day (the 18th) by the district magistrate, I Chien. These calls were returned the 19th. From these officials it was learned that 16 arrests had already been made; that warrants had been issued for all that went to Huashan that fatal morning; that soldiers had been stationed throughout the province to aid in making arrests; that word had been sent to adjoining provinces to apprehend all escaping fugitives, and that large rewards had been offered for the arrest of the leaders in the Huashan affair.
- 21. Objections were raised by the prefect to the consuls attending the trials, their request to be present being refused on the ground that the viceroy's instructions did not permit, but upon the consul's emphatic declaration that they had a right to be present, the prefect communicated with the viceroy and the trials before the consular parties began on August 21
- 22. The consuls claimed the right to be present at all trials of arrested suspects, which was agreed to by the prefect. The plan followed was that the accused, when first arrested, should first be examined by the magistrate or deputy to avoid collusion with other prisoners, then to be examined in open court before an investigating committee.
- 23. To a clear understanding of the origin of the movement that culminated in the horrible affair of August 1, 1895, it is necessary to look into the life of the Vegetarians in the district, and to examine into the incidents and events that transpired a few months prior to the massacre within the district of Kutien, as well as to inquire into the conduct of the officials charged with the maintenance of peace and the execution of the laws in this prefecture; to this end a brief synopsis of events will be of interest.
- 24. The tenets of the "Vegetarian Society" or the "Tsai Hui" prohibit the killing and eating of all flesh meats, the use of opium, wine, and tobacco. This organization has its passwords and ritual; the records and minutes of all meetings are burned at the closing of each sitting. For many years the headquarters of the society were in the Chianghai province, from whence the order was extended to other districts.

⁹ See Part Four. Letters and Reports of the Rev. William Banister.

- 25. In 1892, a propagandist, Liu Hsiang-hsing by name, established the society in the districts of Kutien and Pingnang. As a result of his teaching and the earnest work of his followers in the two districts, the Vegetarians numbered at the beginning of this year, at the least estimate, 3,000. The society, however, did not attract attention until the latter part of 1894, when by the lawless acts of its members it gained much notoriety, and it members increased rapidly in number. By lawless acts the society terrorized the people, attracting many of the evil disposed to their ranks.
- 26. The great attraction at first was evidently the reputed cure of the opium habit, not so much for delivery from the baneful effects of the drug as for release from the expense which the use of the drug entailed upon its consumers. This reputed cure alone attracted a worthless and shiftless class of people. In spreading the order, many irresponsible and dangerous persons were led to follow itinerant pursuits, and thus gain acquaintance with the worst elements of society throughout the districts, which elements sooner or later became members. Each new member is introduced by a petty leader, known as a Yin ching, and at once becomes his blind follower—"If we live, we live together; if we die, we die together" being inculcated. New members go on probation for a certain period, to be admitted to full membership at the general meeting held as the option of the leaders. A part of the initiation at these meetings (known as Yang-kwang) was that the candidate remained in bed in a dark room for a week and only saw his yin ching who attended to his wants. Many continued probationary members because of their failure to abstain from the use of opium or meat.
- 27. Emboldened by the successful spreading of their doctrines and elated by the accession of so many members, the society became one for mutual aid and support. Its members, bound by stringent oaths, under fear of personal torture, violence, and death, were forced to obey all calls of their leaders. They undertook to settle all disputes between a Vegetarian and outsiders without appealing to the law, b force often, with the result that robbery, arson, and even murder were the methods employed.
- 28. As instances of the mutual benefits of the society, there may be mentioned that in August 1894, a Vegetarian had a disagreement with a native convert of the Anglican communion residing at Hia Tien-p'ing, a small village 11 miles to the east of Kutien city; the former, calling to his aid some fellow-members of the society, looted the Christian's shop and threatened to burn it. The native convert sought redress by bringing suit before the district magistrate Wang Yu-yang, who failed to give the case a hearing. Owing to the steps taken by the native Christians, the ill-feeling became stronger and culminated early one morning in the ensuing October in the gathering of Vegetarians from the neighboring villages to the number of about one hundred in the rice fields of the Christians, where at a signal, the firing of a gun, the Vegetarians cut and removed the entire crop of ripe rice. This act not only inflicted personal damage to the owner, but deprived the Government of its lawful tax upon the same. Suit was again brought and one Vegetarian was arrested.
- 29. In December, 1894, while members of the society were holding a meeting in Kutien City, the district magistrate, Wang Yu-yang, acting upon the advice of h is confidential secretary, Chiang, the chief runner of the yamen, caused the arrest of four Vegetarians for using seditious language; each of these arrests was shipped and imprisoned in the magistrate's yamen. A few days later the Vegetarians assembled, to the number of about 100, and entering the yamen showed their contempt for that official as well as for the law by demanding the release of their fellow members. Afraid to resist or ignore the demand, the magistrate entertained the request, and through the medium of Ho Ts'ung-lung, a military officer, Li Ch'-tseng, city magistrate, and Lang Chih-jin, a graduate, who acted as go-between or interceders, Liu Hsiang-hsing, Yeh Shu-ming, Yu Hsun-yang, and Cheng Sui were released and sent out of the yamen in chairs trimmed in red. The secretary, Chiang, for his vigilance, was whipped and dismissed from the service of the yamen. Thus humiliated, the magistrate showed his weakness, and the residents have lost confidence in the magistrate feared to bring their grievances before him for settlement. The Vegetarians arrogated to themselves the rights of [literary] graduates, wearing insignia.

They became loud in their demands, and when not acceded to they compelled compliance with force. This state of affairs induced many people of good intentions and well-to-do to join the society for protection. The British consul informed the Foochow authorities of what had occurred, and it is believed they called for a report and, undoubtedly to conceal his humiliation, weakness, and disgrace, as well as the growing strength of the society, the magistrate made such a report as pacified the authorities.

- 30. At this time the walls and gates of the city being in a dilapidated condition, the magistrate levied a tax to repair the same, and work was begun at once. Anticipating the completion of the repairs, the magistrate sent the draft of a proclamation to the engraver, giving the information that he, the magistrate, was ready to consider the charges then pending at the yamen against the Vegetarians, and calling upon all interested to appear. It was the magistrate's intention not to issue that proclamation becoming known to the wall and gates of the city had been completed. The contents of the proclamation becoming known to the Vegetarians before the engraver had finished his task, anonymous small red placards, "Officials oppress, people rebel," were posted in several parts of the city. Those placards, directed against the magistrate, accused him of persecution, and announced the intention of making war against him, thus openly defying the law and endeavoring by seditious words and threats to intimidate the man. These placards, although unsigned, were attributed to the Vegetarians. This suspicion was confirmed by the testimony brought out before the court.
- 31. In March, 1895, it was reported that the Vegetarians were assembling in the seventeenth township [Sek Chek Du], 10 miles from Kutien, and it was rumored that their intention was to attack the city, killing the district magistrate and several of the head literary men. These rumors caused great alarm. About this time Liu Hisang-hsing, the propagandist, gave his relative Li Ch'i-tseng, information of the intention of the Vegetarians. This magistrate immediately bundled up his goods, and sending for burden bearers directed that the goods be delivered at Kui-kow before evening. A disturbance arising, the bearers declined, and the goods were not taken, but the eight loads were moved into the Fan Ch'un drug store, and the magistrate's family took up their abode in another quarter of the city, at the house of Ch'ing Sin, the head man of the chair coolies. This act was most suspicious, and the district magistrate, knowing about the placards, hearing the rumors, and learning of the action of the city magistrate, closed at once the city gates, barricading them, and ordered the city walls to be constantly patrolled by several hundreds of men, levied from the Lien-chia or home guards. All foreigners living outside the city walls were called in by the authorities and took up their residence within the city walls. Heavy wooden bar gates were soon after erected throughout the city abreast the fire walls, and the practice since has been to close these gates at night.
- 32. Alarmed by this condition of affairs, the district magistrate, Wang Yu-Yang, sent a dispatch to the viceroy, T'an Chung-lin, at Foochow, asking for soldiers. Hearing of this, Tsen Kuang-kuei, a rich citizen living in the First Ward, sent word to his brother, Tseng Huang-ton, a third degree man in office at Foochow, to use his best efforts to prevent the sending of troops, as they were not needed. Li Ch'i-tseng, city magistrate, also endeavored to prevent, and advised against the sending of soldiers. Considering the disorganized condition of the city, these acts are most reprehensible.
- 33. A messenger (one of his soldiers) was sent by the military officer Lin I-hsiung to the place of assembly of the Vegetarians to invite Liu Hsiang-hsing, Tai Jih-chin, and Tang Ch'un, leaders, to come into the city and confer with the district magistrate, Wang Yu-yang. Arriving at the yamen, these leaders disclaimed any intention on the part of the Vegetarians to attack the city. The magistrate then required security for the maintenance of peace and good faith on the part of the Vegetarians, informing them that without security he (the magistrate) dare not open the gates. (The stock of rice in the city was rapidly diminishing, and some of the inhabitants demanded that the gates be opened to admit rice.) Difficulty was experienced in obtaining security. Finally, however, Liy Te-kang and Cheng han, yamen runners, became sureties for the Vegetarians, the gates were then opened, March 29, 1895, and the patrol of the wall ceased.

- 34. Receiving a report from the late Mr. Stewart concerning the state of affairs, the British consul, about April 1, called the attention of the Chinese authorities at Foochow to the perturbed condition at Kutien, and on the 1st of April the British consul addressed a letter to the viceroy, T'an Chung-ling, strongly urging the sending of soldiers to Kutien to secure peace, and for the protection of foreigners. To this letter the viceroy replied two weeks later saying that he had sent an official to Kutien to inquire into the condition of affairs there; that this official had returned reporting that all was quiet, and that there were no grounds for the disquieting rumors. The official, Li Sen-sang, sent to inquire into the situation, arrived in Kutien early in April, and after a stay of only one day returned to Foochow and reported that the condition of affairs did not call for the sending of soldiers. Evidently a gross misrepresentation and concealment of facts, or else the criminal inefficiency of Chinese officials, the district magistrate, the official enquirer, or the viceroy must assume the responsibility, or share it.
- 35. In March, 1895, on account of reports from various parts of the province and the rumors flying about concerning the menacing attitude of the natives, the Unites States had several interviews with the president of the foreign board at Foochow, Taotai Ch'en, in regard to the unsettled condition of the province, and urged that immediate steps be taken in inquire into the condition, and to suppress the existing lawlessness. On April 1 the consul received a letter from Dr. Gregory detailing the events then transpiring in and about Kutien, referred to in paragraphs 32, 33, and 34, and immediately called upon the foreign board and preferred the request that soldiers should be sent at once to Kutien. To this the president agreed and said that they should be sent. Consul Hixson, suspicious that the soldiers might not be sent or that their departure would be delayed, asked that he might be informed of their departure. A few days later Taotai Ch'en sent a deputy to inform the United States consul that agreeably to his request 400 soldiers had been sent. Influenced by the condition of the province, Consul Hixson called all American citizens to come within the limits of the treaty port of Foochow. This call was obeyed by all residing in Kutien or the vicinity except Dr. Gregory, who came as far as Suikow, and learning that affairs had quieted down after the opening of the city gates, returned to Kutien. Miss Hartford, who had frequently claimed that it was perfectly safe, soon afterwards returned to her post. Considering all this the question would naturally be asked, Why did the missionaries not realize the gravity of their situation? It can only be answered that for many years the province of Fuhkien had been considered as most peaceful, and a fruitful field for sowing Christianity. Lulled into security by the records of the past, they were too confident as to the future, and therefore did not give to current events that importance which after events would have justified.
- 36. It would seem that the viceroy, T'an Chung-ling, must have been aware of the condition of affairs and the inefficiency of the district magistrate Wang Yu-yang, for the latter was removed, and Wang Ju-lin succeeded him in May, 1895. The call for soldiers was not answered by the sending of troops. It is relevant to mention here that about the 1st of May Viceroy Tan Chung-lin was transferred to Canton and Pien Pao-ch'uan became viceroy of this province.
- 37. Shortly after his arrival the new district magistrate, Wang Ju-lin, began his rounds collecting taxes. In the latter part of June, while in the village of Hai-yang, 30 miles from Kutien, receiving word that a murder had been committed in the village of Cho-yang, some 6 miles away, he sent runners to investigate the crime. After arriving the runners found that a misunderstanding regarding money matters had arisen between two natives, both heathen, but one a Vegetarian; the latter, assisted by some sixty or seventy members of his society, armed with spears and swords, had attacked the barricaded house of his enemy, forcing their way in, wounding several men, and killing one man, after which they withdrew, looting such articles as were in reach. The runners were prevented by the Vegetarians from making any arrests. Upon hearing this the magistrate, Wang Ju-lin, immediately reported the case to the viceroy, asking for troops. After the murder at Cho-yang a number of robberies by the Vegetarians elsewhere in the district of Kutien were reported.

- 38. The viceroy, Pien Pao-ch'uan, in answer to the report of the district magistrate, Wang Ju-lin, sent Ho Ting, a former magistrate of the district, to investigate the report. Ho ting, after inquiring into the murder, finding hat one hundred o more cases against the Vegetarians were then awaiting examination in the yamen, requested that 1,000 soldiers be sent to Kutien. IN reply to this request, Col. T;an Yu-ye, with 210 soldiers, arrived in Kutien July 23. After the arrival of the soldiers the deputy, Ho Ting, issued a proclamation, calling upon all persons interested in cases pending before the yamen to appear. The arrival of the soldiers, together with the proclamation of Ho Ting, gave the Vegetarians the idea that they would be attacked. The Vegetarians attributed to Mr. Stewart and other foreigners the responsibility for the coming of the troops, and asserted that the missionaries had furnished the funds necessary.
- 39. The soldiers after their arrival made some pretense at drilling and firing; no effort, however, was made to arrest anyone, and they remained within the city limits, although it was well known that no Vegetarian had answered the deputy's summons, and furthermore that the members of this society were assembling at Kung shan ch'i, and mountain 15 miles north and east from Kutien, on which were a number of cattle sheds; this position the Vegetarians proceeded to fortify. In assembling the Vegetarians were seen, by day and by night, passing in armed squads through the district toward their mountain fastness; this movement so alarmed the inhabitants of the villages near this rendezvous that they kept watch night and day, and many families on hearing rumors of attack moved away. The residents of An chang village becoming alarmed, prepared to make a defense; a member of the Lien-chia from this village with a native Christian preacher on July 30 visited the magistrate's yamen in Kutien and informed this official that it was reported that the Vegetarians assembled at Kung shan ch'i intended making a descent upon their village to destroy the chapel and plunder the inhabitants, expecting to obtain money as a rich man lived there; they begged that soldiers might be sent for her protection to arrest the Vegetarians assembled at the fastness. The magistrate, Wang Ju-lin, much alarmed, went to Deputy Ho Ting and reported the situation; the city magistrate, Li Ch'i-tseng, being present, made light of the matter and persuaded the deputy that there could be no truth in the report. No soldiers were sent, but a few policemen [yamen runners] were sent by the magistrate, and they passed the night in the chapel. An chang village is situated between Kung chan ch'i and Huashan, on the road followed by the Vegetarians on their march to Huashan. Had the appeals from this village received proper attention the massacre might have been prevented, for armed Vegetarians, to the number of 298, by actual count, passed that night (July 31) on their way to Huashan.
- 40. Owing to the frequency of disquieting rumors regarding the threatening attitude of the natives towards foreigners in the interior of the province, and also the dilatoriness displayed by the authorities in the settlement of the numerous cases referred to them by the consul, Mr. Hixson, on July 27 last, addressed a letter to the Viceroy Pien Pao-ch'uan urging the prompt taking of strong measures to correct the growing menacing attitude towards foreigners.
- 41. Early on the morning of August 1 the massacre took place, and on the 3d this body of rebels dispersed.
- 42. Before proceeding to the trials of those implicated, this act of Li Ch'i-tseng, city magistrate, should be recorded: When Dr. Gregory appeared on the yamen on the day of the massacre to report the horrible deed and to get assistance, the city magistrate, Li Ch'i-tseng, was present and immediately began to contradict the report, assuring the deputy that it could not be true.
- 43. Soon after the massacre, District Magistrate Wang Ju-lin was removed, and I Chien, appointed in his place, arrived in Kutien August 5; Ch'en Ping-chi, the prefect, reached Kutien on the 7th of August.
- 44. 207 arrests have been made and 88 cases tried before the committee. Most of the arrests have been made by the "Lien-chia" or home guards established in each village, and delivered at the yamen of the district magistrate, Kutien. Soldiers were sent out and distributed over the province to prevent the

escape of suspects and to assist in arrests. Rewards have in many cases led fellow-villagers or acquaintances to track a suspect; and they have in some cases to altercations between the soldiers and the captors, the idea being that the one who delivers the prisoner to the magistrate is entitled to the reward; in one altercation the shoulder of one of the Lien-chia was cut by a native sword. The lawless acts of the Vegetarians, together with the rewards offered, can be assigned as reasons for the activity in making arrests. In come cases a father or brother was arrested with a view to having a guilty son or brother surrender himself. Owing to the strong sense of filial duty in the Chinese, which impels or prompts great personal sacrifices for family, even to the selling of one's life as a substitute tor execution, this plan was very effective.

- 45. Ten suicides to prevent arrest (two by hanging and the rest by starvation in the mountains) have been reported; and after arrest, before trial, several attempts at self-destruction have been made, one by cutting the throat failed, the cut healed and the culprit, one of the actual murderers, was brought to trial and executed; another by an overdose of opium robbed the law of a victim whose destiny would undoubtedly been decapitation.
- 46. The Chinese are entitled to credit for the commendable speed with which arrests were made at first— 193 arrests were made prior to September 21; of these 43 went to Huashan. Since September 21, few if any arrests have been made although the evidence before the magistrate's court implicates over 100; attention has frequently been called to this, still few arrests have been made. Information from other sources swells this number.

INFORMATION SOURCES.

- 47. For thirty years or more the missionaries have labored in this district, and the followers of the two missions aggregate between 3,000 and 4,000. These native Christians have at all times been most alert in furnishing names and information concerning those engaged in the massacres, enabling the committee to begin its labors intelligently and to keep the officials ever mindful that it was possessed of information for which it was not indebted to them. The ignorance of the extent of the information in the hands of the committee acted at first as a powerful incentive to press the work of apprehension and trials; which with good cause might, had it been otherwise, have dragged on; particularly so had the committee been dependent solely upon the testimony elicited at the trial.
- 48. Native Christians have come freely before the committee, giving information as to matters under investigation and have induced heathen natives to do the same. These witnesses from wise and prudential motives can not appear at the magistrate's court. The committee is at liberty to make use freely of such information, but not to incriminate the witnesses by giving their names.
- 49. From these sources the committee has always been informed of any movement or action on the part of the authorities tending to delay the work of the investigation, to cripple or render nil the good effect produced by its presence.
- 50. Furnished at the beginning with a long list of names of those who belonged to the Vegetarian Society that assembled at Kung Shan; of those that went to Huashan, that took active part in the bloody affair; and finally, of those who were or had been in possession of loot—the committee had been most materially assisted in its work and enabled to commence the investigation, with a fair knowledge of the case.

OBSTACLES.

51. At the beginning, the prefect, Ch'en Ping-chi, official in charge, refused to allow the consuls to be present at the trial, and, furthermore, denied their right to be.

- 52. During the trial in the latter part of August the magistrate I Chien issued a proclamation, accompanied by instructions to the head of the Lien-chia, in which Vegetarians and Christians were specifically mentioned—the former, if disposed to do well in the future, would be allowed to enter the "Lien chia," the latter could also be enrolled, but the dates of birth and of becoming Christians must be registered. This had a baneful effect, at once rehabilitating the Vegetarians and checking the arrests, dampening the ardor of the "Lien-chia" and arousing suspicion in the vicinity of the Christians, marking them as a special class, for frequently even in the vicinity of the magistrate's yamen threats had been made that when the Huashan case should have been concluded and the committee have taken its departure the Christian's turn would come. Objections were at once made to this proclamation and accompanying instructions; their recall was demanded and the issuing of a new proclamation with instructions insisted upon in which no allusion whatever should be made to Christians, while forbidding the enrollment of Vegetarians until they had, after a probationary period of one year, given evidence of their intention to be law-abiding, and then only after consulting the consuls. The prefect, Ch'en, on September 5, having agreed to this, submitted a draft for approval coinciding with the views expressed by the committee; the draft was approved and returned to the prefect, who assured the committee that the objectionable one would be immediately recalled and replaced by the one approved.
- 53. On September 12, the obnoxious proclamation not having been recalled or the approved one issued, the committee invited the attention of Taotai Hsu, who had arrived two days before, to this neglect on the part of the prefect. The Taotai, being apparently in accord with the committee, consented to recall the obnoxious proclamation and instructions, and to replace them with those of his own. A few days afterwards he submitted a draft for approval, and after consultation with and the concurrence of the committee, he issued the new proclamation, furnishing the committee with official copies. Greatly to our surprise on the 24th of September the committee received information that the magistrate had again issued a proclamation on the lines of the first one, ignoring that of the Taotai, from which nothing had been heard besides failing to recall the original. Upon calling the attention of the Taotai to this act on the part of the magistrate, he (the magistrate) hurriedly sent, that same night about midnight, and recalled the second proclamation and instructions, then denied ever having issued them. The Taotai, in reply to the communication addressed to him upon the subject, said the magistrate denied having issued any such proclamation, but had punished his writer or secretary for the same, accusing him of sealing his magisterial seal and placing it upon a proclamation of his own fabrication, without the consent or the knowledge of the magistrate. It was two weeks after this occurrence, and only after repeated and persistent demands were made upon the taotai, that the obnoxious proclamation and instructions first issued were recalled, and not until the last one was brought in was any new one issued; thus fully six weeks the obnoxious proclamation and instructions remained in force at a critical period of the trial, producing a bad effect from which the investigation suffered to the end—arrests were virtually stopped.
- 54. During the trial very early in September some 48 suspects were released from arrest; some of these released suspects went home, breathing threatenings by the roadside, publishing to those they met that the Christians had had their turn, but, after the close of the trials and the departure of the committee the Vegetarians would have their inning, and the Christians would hen be dealt with for all that had been done against the Vegetarians. These threats having been brought to the attention of the committee, upon inquiry the release of the suspects was revealed. The officials, when confronted and their reason demanded for turning out these suspects contrary to previous agreement (see para. 23) without consulting the committee, replied that there being no evidence against them, and the prison being crowded, they were allowed to go upon security. It was found that some of those who had been released were guilty of complicity in the Huashan attack, having had loot in their possession. The return to jail of those released was demanded, and the officials were informed that no more releases would be permitted except after examination in open court. The officials wrangled and argued, but finally consented to the to the rearrest of the released parties. The return of these suspects was exceedingly slow, only nine of the number having returned to jail within a week of the demand, and to the time of withdrawal from Kutien the majority were still free.

- 55. Although repeatedly asked for, a list of persons arrested and held in the Yamen jail was not obtainable until a month after the trials commenced; frequent requests to be notified daily of the new arrests elicited but few stray lists.
- 56. It was noticeable that the prisoners when brought into court would say to each other, "Tell what you saw, but not what you know." As the trial progressed it was noted that there must be more or less intercourse between the prisoners; that some were poorly fed; that others were very dirty; some were handled roughly; while others were treated with more or less deference; the policy of the prisoners was, with little doubt, outlined by someone or previously agreed among themselves. The testimony of some prisoners brought into court was often contradictory, evasive, and impossible to be true—one minute admitting their presence at the massacre, the next denying the same, and yet with all this their random answers to questions showed a knowledge which only a personal presence could have given. The prisoners were mostly ignorant and of the lower and laboring classes, constantly pleading that on account of their illiteracy their memory was feeble, forgetting that without the aids of education the senses of memory and sight are most keenly developed.
- 57. After the arrival of Hsu Taotai, the prosecution on the part of the Chinese officials very perceptibly lagged. To explain this partly, the viceroy's position, as announced to the committee by Hsu Taotai September 27, was that the massacre was considered by him as an ordinary murder, and the culprits were amenable only to the law applying to such cases. This opinion was contrary to the acts of his subordinates, the Taotai, prefect, and district magistrate, as well as to heir frequent declarations made in open court. Their only desire, at least as regards the magistrate and his deputies, seemed to be to make the testimony of the different prisoners agree in minimizing the number of participants in the massacre, and in strenuously avoiding any reference to the society, its origin, motives, and acts prior to the fatal occurrence. It is confidently believed that the testimony is falsified in order to produce harmonious statements, thus agreeing with the ethics of Chinese law.
- 58. The number of persons who started from the fastness for Huashan and the number reaching and present at the massacre suffered diminution as the trials progressed. The first prisoners examined gave more than 200 as the number that started, and considerably over 100 that arrived, while later this number diminished one-half at least. From outside sources, by actual count, nearly 300 started and on the return 120 stopped at a certain village for the mid-day meal, where they were counted. From the testimony of prisoners and others, the efforts of the officers and their subordinates were directed toward minimizing the numbers engaged. They fixed upon the number of 60 or 70 as those who assembled at Huashan, which I believe to be about one-half the correct number. Often was this number admitted by prisoners, and from outside sources it was confirmed. The magistrate and his deputies frequently so framed their questions as to convey the answer desired. This was particularly so in reference to numbers engaged. Deputies, sent to neighboring villages to make inquiries, performed their duties in a perfunctory manner, leaving the work to their runners and interpreters to do. In one case it was brought to the notice of the committee that at the village of Ta-ch'en the deputies arrived at 5 p.m., leaving at 9 the next morning; that the examination ended by getting a statement from the head men, prompted by the interpreter, to which the name of one of the Christians was forged. The other Christian signed under coercion.

PROCEDURE.

60. The accused examined first by the district magistrate or his deputy is, in accordance with Chinese custom, required to confess. This confession, often confirmed by confrontal with other prisoners, establishes the guilt. If guilty, the accused is required to sign his confession by an imprint of the left open hand, inked for the purpose, which signifies that "This is true," and from it the accused is not allowed to recede. After the first examination the prisoner is then brought before the investigating committee, in open court, and is questioned by the Chinese officials upon his confession, the questions being asked in a manner to bring out answers confirming his confession. This being done, the consuls

then questioned and cross-examined the accused. Frequently other prisoners were introduced for purposes of identification and confrontation, to incriminate others or themselves as well as to elucidate testimony.

THE EVIDENCE.

- 61. The evidence, consisting of the statements of the survivors, the testimony deduced in trial, and that obtained from outside sources, shows that advantage was taken of the presence of soldiers in Kutien for the Vegetarians to assemble in large numbers at Kung shan ch'i (fastness). The leaders issued slips or notices to the yin-chin (petty leaders) to bring their followers to the fastness. Many were invited by word of mouth to see the military adviser, Cheng Chin-chiu, to assemble, or commanded to assemble. The query as to cause or reason for thus assembling met the reply that the soldiers had come to arrest all Vegetarians, and it was therefore necessary to defend themselves. Under this pretext many returned to their homes to obtain arms and food. The information gained by the committee, from this evidence of the prisoners tried and from other sources, point to a general uprising, in which other districts and provinces were expected to join. As near as we can judge, it was to have occurred during the eighth moon (October).
- 62. Cheng Chin-chiu, known as "Long Finger-nails" on account of the great length of his nails (three inches long on left hand), under the guise of a fortune-teller, reached the district of Kutien during the sixth moon (July) of this year, and shortly after the leaders evidently came together and the planning and plotting began. He was supposed to be a great military leader. The previous history of this man is shrouded in mystery; partially educated, being both mentally and intellectually the superior, as well as physically the inferior, of any other prisoner that was brought before the committee, he talked readily and most glibly, was conversant with the mandarin, as well as with the local dialects, and it is believed that he was not known as a Vegetarian to those actively engaged in the massacre. It is possible, however, that he may have been a member well advanced in the society, or else the readiness with which he attracted and made us of its members cannot be easily understood. He evidently was an emissary sent for the purpose of inciting rebellious acts in this district. It is stated that he came from the west gate of Foochow. No attempt was made by the officials to obtain the history of this man that the committee is aware of.
- 63. Associated with Cheng Chiu-chin in planning and organizing the massacre was Tu Chu-yi, Liu Hsiang-Hsing, Yao Pa-chang, Chang Chi, tai Nu-Lang, Yeh Fu-tieh. All of these except Cheng Chiu-chin and Chang Chi, visited Huashan and took active parts in the attack. The latter, formerly head runner in the magistrate's yamen at Kutien (but dismissed), one of the leading Vegetarians, and mixed up in rebellious acts prior to this, denied the former's claim, and disagreed with the plans proposed. He was the one who gave information to Anchong village of the contemplated attack, and was selected to carry a letter to Foochow. Opening the same, he returned and disputed with the others, threatening to kill Tu Chu-yi and others. The committee surrendered all claim to this man as a participant in the massacre. He was held by the Chinese, and executed for his previous acts. As a result of the call sent out, over 300 members of the Vegetarian society gathered at some cattle sheds on the top of Kung shan ch'i during the last week of July, 1895, where they were armed.
- 64. To carry on an open rebellion and to defy the soldiers, money and good were necessary. To obtain these, robbery was resorted to and certain villages, where there were rich men, were selected as objects of attack. Cheng Chin-chiu (whether inspired by others or not can not be positively stated, but it is confidently believed that he was acting under instructions) evidently directed attention to foreigners. Considering the general anti-foreign sentiment that existed, this plan was readily accepted, and designs were entertained, first against the foreign property in the city of Kutien, which Chang Chi advocated, and second, against neighboring villages, and lastly against foreign property at Huashan. The reason given for not attacking Anchong village was that the inhabitants had made preparations to defend themselves.

- 65. In order to show that this step was approved of and ordered by the spirits, Cheng Chin-chiu proposed to decide by lottery the destination, and he alone prepared slips of paper and deposited the same in a receptacle which, after incantations and prayers to Heaven, were drawn out, using incense sticks as chop-sticks, one at a time. This was repeated three times. Each slip of paper drawn out had written upon it "Huashan." This drawing occurred three successive nights. It should be mentioned here that the evidence shows that no one but Cheng Chiu-chin saw the writing or prepared the slips. After the lottery had decided the point of attack, strict orders were issued to kill all foreigners, to rob and to burn; that all plunder should be brought back to the fastness and turned into a common store, to be devoted to the purchase of provisions and munitions; oaths of fidelity were taken by the members, such as to be torn to pieces by five wild horses, to be burned alive or suffer death by drowning, if unfaithful to their vows. Lists of the members were made out for mustering the horde, and after saluting a triangular flag, the march for Huashan was commenced about dusk on the 31st of July.
- 66. Two months before the assembly at Kung shan ch'i. Liu Hsian-hsing had visited Huashan village, and, in company with two resident Vegetarians of the village, had inspected the foreign houses as well as the native house to be occupied by Miss Hartford. Mr. Phillip's intention to visit Huashan was unknown to the native guides, as he did not arrive until a few days before the massacre. This man, Liu Hsiang-hsing, reputed to be of great physical strength, an itinerant peddler accustomed to journey from place to place, was well fitted to lead the way. Tu Chu-yi, a most determined man, both forcible and magnetic, was selected to carry the flag, while Yeh Fu-tieh, a daring and fearless man, was chosen to give the signal, by firing a gun, to commence the attack.
- 67. About dusk on the last day of July the crowd, after saluting the flag, followed Liu Hsiang-hsing, who, armed with a trident, led the way to Huashan, followed by 300 or more Vegetarians, tu Chu-yi, with the flag, bringing up the rear. These men, in passing by An chang village, not quite half way to Huashan, numbered by count about midnight 298 men, who were armed with swords, tridents, spears and sticks. From this time until the arrival at Huashan, between 6 and 7 o'clock in the morning, August 1, the numbers were diminished by desertion, from fatigue and other causes until they numbered between 100 and 200 men when they arrived on the crest of the hill within view of the foreign houses.
- 68. The adult members of the houses had not risen for the day, two of the children were on the slope of the hill just east of the houses picking wild flowers; a gun was fired, and a rush was made down the hill by the Vegetarian horde for the houses. The children picking flowers first heard the shouting, and then saw the howling mob; one fled toward the nearest house, the residence of their parents, to give the alarm, whereas the other lay down in the grass, with the idea of escaping discovery, but she was caught, struck, and dragged by the hair. Numbers of the assailants then forced their way into each house, the teachers and servants fleeing, and the work of murder, robbery, and arson began.
- 69. Most of these men were bent upon plundering; ransacking all receptacles and tearing up bedding in the search for articles of value, particularly money. In their eagerness to obtain loot they were often engaged in scuffles, paying little or no attention to the occupants unless actually face to face, when they would strike them down with their weapons.
- 70. The occupants, in their efforts to escape, attempted to get out first by the kitchen, but finding the door locked they returned to a bedroom, and in the attempt to get out by its window were driven back by men on the outside; finally, rushing from the room to escape by the rear, Miss Newcombe became separated and escaped by the front door to meet her death.
- 71. The other ladies escaped by the rear, but were quickly surrounded by ten or more Vegetarians; while pleading for their lives, offering both jewels and money to their assailants, an old man from the neighboring village interceded on their behalf (the identity of this man the committee failed to establish). At these appeals the crowd surrounding these ladies hesitated, when Tu Chu-yi, appearing and noticing the hesitation of his followers, waved the flag and commanded the men to carry out their

orders and kill quickly. These ladies were then all stricken down at the rear of the upper house, and only one lives to tell the tale.

- 72. Liu Hsiang-hsing, seeing the work under way at the upper house, passed on to the front of the lower house, where, encountering a lady, he stabbed her with his trident; this lady, Miss Newcombe, falling, he passed rapidly on and turning westward from the lower house, following the path that led by the rear to the native house occupied by Miss Hartford. Upon reaching this house he confronted Miss Hartford, who, seizing the weapon—receiving a scratch under the ear—diverted the blow, but was thrown down by the shock and jostling that ensued. After she fell, the fiend began to beat her with the handle of his weapon. Mrs. Teng, wife of Miss Hartford's Chinese teacher, must have at this time have caught the murderer by his cue [queue-pigtail]; turning him and receiving a kick in the abdomen, she was knocked down. Miss Hartford's servant, Siong Duk, then grabbed the trident, wrenching it away, and began to beat the murderer with the handle, knocking him down. Liu Hsiang-hsing recovered himself, and in trying to escape tumbled down over an embankment, but finally got away. The native teacher of Miss Hartford early took refuge in flight, leaving his pupil and his wife to battle alone with the murderer. Miss Hartford in trying to escape fell down a terrace; gathering herself and going to the door of a native house nearby, in which her teacher had taken refuge, she was denied admission; but finally, aided by Ah-kieng, a servant, she found a refuge.
- 73. During this time the fiendish work was still going on at the two foreign houses, the Vegetarians smashing and breaking the furniture, piling up the debris; kerosene, bought in bamboo jugs and found on the premises, was poured around and the match applied. Selecting such articles as could be conveniently carried, robbing both dead and living, the mob at the signal of a horn took up its retreat.
- 74. Miss Codrington and the wounded children, seeing that the Vegetarians had withdrawn, exerted themselves to save and assist their fellow-sufferers, nobly dragging from the burning buildings those who were still living, as well as the bodies of the dead that were on the outside in danger of being burned. Then by their own efforts, aided by the native servant, Siong Duk, of Miss Hartford, they took refuge in the latter's house, where Mr. Phillips and Dr. Gregory found them.
- 75. After the departure of the assailants the villagers promptly removed every article obtainable, refusing to aid in carrying the wounded into the houses or to care for them in any way. Upon visiting the ruins on September 26 the committee failed to find the smallest piece of metal, all having been stolen by the villagers.
- 76. Upon leaving the scene of the massacre many of the assailants found their way back to the fastness, with such loot as they had, going by different routes. As many as 120,by actual count, stopped en route at a village for their midday meal. Others, with their loot, immediately deserted the main body and proceeded to their homes by various ways, in groups of greater or less numbers. Still others, fearing robbery by their companions, struggled back to Kung shan ch'i by routes other than that followed by the main body. Arriving at the fastness, the loot was generally surrendered and turned into a common store to be appropriated later, before disbanding by the leaders and by those fortunate to seize the articles. In many villages loot was paraded and even offered for sale. Very little loot was found upon those arrested, and none but so found was ever recovered.
- 77. It is probable that this attack had been contemplated by some (?) long before its realization, as evidenced (1) the visit of Cheng Chiu-chin, who, arriving in the district but a few days prior to the deed, rapidly assumed sway over a horde of men untrained except to do the bidding of their yin-chin (petty leaders); (2) his prophecy contained in his letter of invitation to Chang Chi, undoubtedly the superior of the other leaders in many ways; (3) the visit of Liu Hsiang-hsing to Huashan to spy out the premises; (4) the frequent visits, prior to the attack, to the foreign houses of stranger faces; (5) the inquiring if firearms were kept in the house, the servants answering no; (6) together with the fact that visits had

within a few months been made by many of the leaders to Foochow, notably by Tu Chi-yi and Liu Hsiang-hsing, ostensibly to attend meetings of the society held on a small island between the two bridges. These incidents, in my mind, point to a time and place, other than the gathering at the fastness, when this diabolical plot was conceived. There is very little, if any, proof to show that the plot was purely one against foreigners, and it is believed it was not; considering that indications show it was mainly insurrectionary in its tendency, and that money being essential for a successful rebellion, this attack on Huashan was one of a number of side plans to obtain the necessary funds.

- 78. It also appears that after the attack on Huashan a number of armed men were seen going from Kung chan ch'i toward Kutien. These men, 16 in number, under a leader (since beheaded) carrying a flag, passed during the night of August 3 through villages on the road between the two places. Their designation they refused to impact, but as some of the inhabitants of Kutien reported having seen armed men in the vicinity of the bridge (picture) crossing the creek at the east gate of the city, the rebels can be credited with the intention of attacking the city. This was unquestionably the plan of Chung Chi, and one of the points that led to the open rupture between him and the other leaders.
- 79. The prophecy referred to in paragraph 77, as contained in the invitation of Cheng Chiu-chiu to Chang Chi was, "Five hundred years ago it was decided Vegetarians' affairs are important." A table of arrests, trials, and results is appended, marked F.
- 80. It is apparent that United States citizens resident in China should be required to register at the consulate nearest their usual domicile, and also to keep that official informed of their movements; furthermore, they should be enjoined to be amenable to consular authority. If this condition can be secured it would often be productive of good results.
- 81. The conduct of Miss Hartford's servant, Siong Duk, also that of Mrs. Teng, the wife of her native teacher, both natives of China and converts to Christianity, deserve some official recognition. But for their devotion and courage, the opposite of that displayed by the native servants of the British members of that colony, the United States would have lost a citizen by murder. It is a pleasant duty to commend these persons to such favorable action as you may deem appropriate, being of the opinion that their humanity and fidelity should be noticed and marked in some substantial manner. (paras. 10,72.)
- 82. The behavior of the residents of Huashan village, more particularly those living in the immediate vicinity of the two houses destroyed, is deserving of condemnation, for (1) their plundering of the ruins, even in the presence of the wounded and dead; (2) their refusal to render any aid, except under compulsion, to care for the living and the dead, and also to transport them to Sui-kow; and (3) lastly, but of great importance, their failure in any way to go to the aid or succor of this colony when subjected to the dastardly attack, which merits severe censure. Such action should be taken as will inflict upon every one incriminated, by residence or presence, a lasting reminder of their failure to protect human life and property. A most worthy exception, and one deserving of great praise and reward, is the old man who alone of the mob and bystanders interceded for the lives of the ladies surrounded at the rear of the house by the assassins (par. 71).
- 83. Without advocating any money indemnity, leave can not be taken of the subject without suggesting that personal losses should be made good; and, also, that the children, so suddenly robbed of heir natural protectors and providers, who survived this terrible calamity, and passed through, as it were, the very gates of death, should receive some remuneration for their irreparable loss.
- 84. The experience gained during the investigation without question shows that in future inquiries of a similar nature much time will be saved and better results be obtained if before work begins a Chinese official of appropriate rank, vested with plenary powers, be appointed or designated by the Throne as its representative to be associated with the inquiry. The committee was convinced of this necessity early in the investigation. Such an appointment gains little or nothing if not vested with full power, thus

avoiding the circumlocutory methods pursued of referring all vital questions to a superior many miles removed. It removes also the shifting of responsibility, the source of much misunderstanding, and avoids the great obstacle of misrepresentation of facts and conditions, all of which were experienced by the committee.

- 85. To conclude, attention is respectfully invited to the following summary regarding the responsibility of certain officials, who, but for their inertness, inefficiency, and culpable neglect, could have prevented the crime that has been made the subject of this report.
- 86. Li Ch'i-tseng, city magistrate, reputed to have occupied the office in Kutien for twenty-eight years, also reputed to be a relative of Liu Hsiang-hsing (para. 26.) the propagandist, but his position and length of service should have been a great aid to the district magistrate of Kutien, but he proved by his acts to have been more the friend and abettor of the lawless than an official charged with the maintenance of good order and the administration of the law of the country. He acted as the go-between or interceder for the Vegetarians that (para. 30) invaded the vamen and demanded the release of the Vegetarians held for using seditious language. Acting upon information (par. 32), he attempted to remove his goods and family from Kutien when that city was threatened by the Vegetarians in March, 1895. He endeavored (para. 33) to prevent the sending of soldiers to Kutien when the district magistrate requested the viceroy to send them. He tried to influence the deputy, Ho Ting (par. 40). Contrary to the appeals of the villagers from An Chong, when that place was threatened with an attack from the Vegetarians assembling at Kung shan ch'i in July, 1895, just prior to the massacre; and finally, after the massacre, he attempted to influence the deputy, Ho Ting, making light of the affair and acting in a contradictory manner, while Dr. Gregory was making an appeal for soldiers to be sent to Huashan on the day of the massacre (par. 43). His conduct merits the strongest condemnation and plainly indicates his sympathies with the lawless Vegetarians and fully establishes his criminal inefficiency for any official position. His acts should be visited with the severest punishment.
- 87. Wang Yu-yang, district magistrate at Kutien prior to May, 1895, as indicated in paragraph 29, showed his weakness and inefficiency in failing to take cognizance of the lawless and depredatory acts of Vegetarians in August and again in October, 1894, at the village of Hsia Tien-ping. Again, although prompted to do his duty by his confidential secretary, Chiang (par. 30), he allowed himself to be intimidated and coerced into releasing Vegetarians that he had caused the arrest of for using seditious language; furthermore, he entered into negotiations with a lawless element, assembled at his yamen to intimidate hi; he accepted their dictation as to the disposition of prisoners then in his custody, and as to degrading, punishing, and dismissing his secretary, who had influenced him on the side of law and order. He displayed cowardice and failed to take prompt and energetic measures to carry out his intentions (par. 31) in disposing of the numerous cases that had accumulated at his yamen. Instead of taking proper measures to meet and to overcome the rebellious acts of Vegetarians (para. 32), he became alarmed (para. 33) and consented to and did confer with leaders of the rebels (para. 34), accepting their false statements upon the poorest of security. And he utterly failed to make known to the official (para. 35) sent by the viceroy to inquire into the condition of affairs that authorized his call (par. 33) for soldiers, the lawless condition rife in his magistracy-and this, either from fear of exposing his inability to cope with the situation, or from shame to confess the humiliation to which he had been subjected. He allowed this official to depart after a stay of but one day, and to carry back to the viceroy the impression (par. 36) that the condition of affairs at Kutien did not warrant the sending of troops to that district. Owing to his timidity, apathy, and supineness, this official is guilty of a gross and criminal neglect of duty. His acts give proof of his inefficiency, and merit severe punishment.
- 88. Li Sen-sang, the wei-yuan, sent by the viceroy, T'an Chung-lin, in response to the calls of Wang Yuyang, district magistrate, Kutien (para. 33), and of the British consul (par. 35), and the request of the United States consul (par. 4.36), did fail properly to perform his duties. This man had previously gained notoriety while magistrate of the Kien-yang district in a case involving a British missionary, in which a

house was burnt and excrement thrown. He remained only one day at Kutien, and then returned to Foochow, reporting that the district was quiet, and that there were no grounds for disquieting rumors of the dispatching of troops—a gross dereliction of duty, as the lawless acts in the district of Kutien could have been learned if any but a most superficial inquiry had been made. The conduct of this official deserves the severest censure.

- 89. Tseng Kuang-kuei, the rich citizen of the First ward, Kutien, should be required to explain his action (par. 33) in opposing the sending of soldiers in response to the magistrate's call. Tseng Kuang-ton, brother of the above mentioned, should be interrogated as to his efforts, at the request of his brother, to prevent the sending of troops as called for (par. 33). The brothers merit censure for their interference and their want of supporting the magistrate accredited to the Kutien district.
- 90. Wang Ju-lin, the official who relieved Wang Yu-yang in May, 1895, as district magistrate, Kutien, undoubtedly fell heir to the disgruntled condition of the district due to the failures and inefficiency of his predecessors. Apparently he accepted the situation and remained inactive until the murder at Cho-yang village (para. 38), when he made a request upon the viceroy for troops. It is reported that this magistrate, Wang Ju-lin, has been degraded. He was supplanted by I Chien. (It should be stated that this official, Wang Ju-lin, who was sent by Ho Ting, the deputy, to the scene of the massacre, upon the request of Dr. Gregory for soldiers, acted upon arriving at Huashan as if paralyzed with fear, remarking, "This is all the fault of the Foochow authorities. I never asked for soldiers and what was the good of sending 200 when the Vegetarians are in thousands?")
- 91. Ho Ting, a deputy, was sent in response to the call of Wang Ju-lin (par. 39), to investigate his report. Although impressed with the gravity of the situation, he failed, after the arrival of the soldiers, to take any active steps tending to ascertain the truth of the rumors then flying about, or to disperse the Vegetarians assembled at Kung shan ch'i or heed the calls from threatened villages (ar. 40). He acted promptly after the massacre (par. 13) upon the demand of Dr. Gregory. This official is culpable, having shirked the responsibility of attacking the assembled rebels at the fastness, mainly for want of soldiers, thinking that the force at his disposal (200) greatly inadequate to the situation. Had he displayed the same promptness before the massacre that he showed afterwards, the necessity for the censure and future action in his case would not exist. It is reported that he gave no orders to the military to leave the city.
- 92. I Chien, acting district magistrate, who superseded Wang Ju-lin as the magistrate of Kutien District, arrived at Kutien August 5, four days after the massacre. He deserves praise for the avidity with which arrests were first made, also for the energy displayed in conducting the trials, but this zeal soon fell off and the arrests diminished (para 21, 47). He was responsible for the method of conducting examinations and the custody of the prisoners (para. 57). Some were subjected to the most stringent examinations; in the case of others these were less exacting. It was evident that the prisoners connected with or identified with previous lawless acts, particularly those directed against officials, were treated with great severity, showing a strong desire on his part to punish offenders against the Chinese rather those implicated with the case in hand. Some of the leaders were treated gently by the yamen runners, almost with deference. After the arrival of Hsu Taotai the proceedings before the magistrate were marked with apathy, a listlessness, on the part of the magistrate and his deputies. This official displayed no desire to obtain any information tending to show the origin of the movement or the conception of the attack prior to the gathering at the fastness. This method prevented the committee from tracing direct responsibility for the attack beyond the murderers themselves. The issue of the obnoxious proclamation (par. 53), and the reissue (so to speak) mentioned in paragraph 54, undoubtedly showed an animosity against Christians, and proved detrimental to the inquiry. The unwarranted release of the suspects (par. 55) also showed the indifference of the official to the investigation by the committee. The attempt, by asking leading questions, to make the testimony of different prisoners (pars. 58,59) harmonize, and to minimize the numbers engaged, showed a disposition to belittle the inquiry. The opinion is entertained that his man

has undoubted ability, and that if free to act, unhampered by superiors, and if influenced by a desire to sift the matter, he would prove a fearless official. It is difficult to overlook his evident antiforeign sentiments; and for these he, as an official, deserves censure, for he at times showed disgust and contempt.

- 93. T'an Pao-chien, now acting salt Taotai, was the prefect residing at Foochow. Unable to attend to both duties, he was relieved of the office of prefect in July, 1895. Prior to July, being the superior official, he was in a measure responsible for the perturbed condition of his prefecture, and therefore deserves condemnation. His failure to see that his subordinates, the magistrates, performed their duties efficiently merits censure. He should have informed himself of the true state of affairs and have taken prompt measures to correct the growing lawlessness.
- 94. Ch'en Ping-chi, as acting prefect, the substitute for T'an Pao-chien, failed to inform himself of the true condition of affairs in his prefecture, or if informed did not take measures to remedy the same, not going to his post until after the massacre. While on his way to Kutien, he failed to render promptly the assistance requested by Dr. Gregory (pars. 14, 52), which humanity demanded. His refusal to allow the consuls to be present at trials (par. 22) should not be overlooked. He allowed the magistrate to issue the obnoxious proclamation (par. 23), and failed, when his attention had been called to the matter, to have the same at once recalled. He allowed the magistrate to release incriminated suspects (par. 55) without consulting the consuls, as agreed upon (par. 23) and failed to order arrests. He, furthermore, allowed the magistrate and deputies to conduct examinations and record evidence in a manner at variance with the testimony elicited before the committee.
- 95. Hsu Hsing-yi, Taotai, sent in response to the request of the committee for a high official with plenary powers, arrived in Kutien September 10. From this date the arrests rapidly decreased, and the vigor of the prosecution on the part of the Chinese officials perceptibly diminished. He allowed the magistrate to reissue the obnoxious proclamation, after having supplied the consults with official copies of a new proclamation that met with their approval (par. 54). When his attention was called to the duplicity of the magistrate, he accepted from his an explanation known to be inconsistent with the proper performance of duty. He, in his report to the viceroy, quoted by the Tsung-li Yamen to you, under date of October 6, falsely represented the condition of affairs, and made malicious and false charges against the native Christians.
- 96. T'an Chung-lin, viceroy prior to May, 1895, but now at Canton, failed to take proper measures to inform himself as to the true condition of affairs in the district of Kutien. He failed to take the necessary steps when informed by the British consul (par. 35) of the perturbed condition in Kutien district, to correct the same. He failed to act promptly upon the receipt of a request from the district magistrate, Wang Yu-yang, in March 1895, (par. 33) for soldiers; but, instead of so doing, caused a delay by sending Li Sen0seng to investigate, who failed properly to perform his mission. This viceroy by removing the district magistrate, Wang Yu-yang, shortly afterwards, gives proof of the failure on his part properly to administer the laws, and also shows that he performed the duties of his high office in a most culpable and inefficient manner. He should be severely dealt with.
- 97. Pen pao-ch'uan, viceroy since May, 1895, is culpable, (1) for failing to heed the warning contained in district magistrate Wang Ju-lin's request for troops in June, 1895 (pars. 39, 39), causing delay by sending Ho Ting to investigate, and (2) upon receiving the latter's report, for sending a force inadequate to the occasion; (3) for placing obstacles in the way of the committee reaching Kutien promptly to begin the investigation; (4) for so construing the law as to lessen the gravity of the crime; (5) for delay in sending Hsu Taotai in compliance with imperial edict, (6) for informing the consuls that Hsu Taotai had been appointed on the foreign board, concealing the fact that the latter was appointed to assist in the inquiry, and (7) for delaying official action in the cases of criminals proved by their own confessions to have, by their acts, merited death. It is believed that two sets of instructions were issued by the viceroy

to his subordinates at Kutien, one to be made public, the other private, materially altering the first and productive of delay, which caused strong protests on the part of the committee.

- 98. Referring to paragraph 36, attention is called to the conduct of the president of the foreign board at Foochow, Taotai Ch'en, informing the United States consul, in answer to the latter's request that immediate steps be taken to suppress the growing lawlessness near Kutien, that 400 soldiers had been sent, whereas this information could not be substantiated at Kutien.
- 99. As a result of the investigation, 26 criminals have been beheaded—7 on September 17, and 14 on October 21, at Kutien, and 5 at Foochow, November 7, 1895. The committee has never asked, suggested, or recommended clemency, but persistently demanded that the participants in the massacre should be tried, convicted, and sentenced in accordance with the criminal code of China. The committee furthermore regarded its duty solely that of investigating, never assuming judicial or other functions, but recognizing that the ultimate settlement belonged to the United States Government.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant, J. S. Newell, *Commander, United States Navy, Member of the Committee of Investigation on the part of the United States,.*

To Hon, Charles Denby, United States Minister, Peking, China.

APPENDICES

The Statements of Miss Mabel C. Hartford; Miss Flora Codrington; Miss Kathleen Stewart, Rev. H. S. Phillips, Dr. J. J. Gregory, M.D. are reproduced In Part Eight, and elsewhere in newspaper reports.

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, December 26, 1895. No. 2451, Denby to Olney.

Subject: The dilatory conduct of the Viceroy at Foochow.

Synopsis: The Viceroy denies the charges made against him. Consul Hixson is advised to leave questions growing out of Kutien massacre to be treated after his report is received.

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, December 26, 1895. No. 2451, Denby to Olney.

Sir: In my despatch No 2449 of the 13th instant I enclosed a copy of a telegram received from Consul Hixson concerning the dilatory conduct of the Viceroy at Foochow and I informed you that I had addressed the Tsungli Yamen on the subject thereof.

The Viceroy has since consented to receive the Consul.

I am now in receipt of a note from the Yamen wherein it sets forth a communication from the Viceroy denying all the charges made against him, and wherein he deprecates the activity of Consul Hixson on the ground that only one American was injured and her assailant has been executed. This is a narrow view to take as I have already stated to the Yamen.

I have thought, however, that the general questions involved in the consideration of the Kutien massacre would be handled better after the joint report of Messrs Hixson and Newell has been received than at this time. Comprehensive demands looking to the protection of Americans can then be more easily formulated. In this view I have addressed to Consul Hixson a despatch of which a copy is enclosed, which I submit for your approval. I have, etc., Charles Denby

Enclosure in N0. 2456 MR. Dnby to Mr. Hixson

NO 112. December 26th, 1895.

Sir:—In view of the fact that the Department has demanded an immediate report from you touching all matters connected with the massacre at Kutien, it would seem best for you not to take up any general matter therewith until you have received instructions from the Department directly or through me.

My instructions with regard to the Szechuan riots are not to make any further demand on the Chinese Government until the report of the Commission which was sent to that Province has been received.

The conclusion would seem to be that some general line of policy will be adopted.

This suggestion will not of course prevent you from taking up and pressing on the local authorities the settlement of such local cases as you specified in your recent telegram, such as the Hungwai, Hochiang, and Ninghua cases. I am, etc. (sgd) Charles Denby.

FRUS, Legation of the United States. Peking, February 10, 1896, No. 2478, Denby to Olney.

Sir: I have the honor to inform you that Mr. Hixson, Consul at Foochow, is still suffering with typhoid fever. The report as to his condition received today is that he is not able to sit up but is convalescent. The forwarding of his report on the Kucheng riots has been delayed by his illness. I suppose that he has wired the Department to this effect. I have, etc., Charles Denby